



Southern California Association of Governments
Remote Participation Only
February 4, 2021

**ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
THURSDAY, JANUARY 7, 2021**

THE FOLLOWING MINUTES ARE A SUMMARY OF ACTIONS TAKEN BY THE ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE (EEC). A DIGITAL RECORDING OF THE ACTUAL MEETING IS AVAILABLE AT: <http://scag.iqm2.com/Citizens/>

The Energy and Environment Committee (EEC) held its meeting telephonically and electronically given public health directives limiting public gatherings due to the threat of COVID-19 and in compliance with the Governor’s recent Executive Order N-29-20. A quorum was present.

Members Present

Hon. David Pollock, Moorpark (Chair)

- Hon. Victoria Baca, Moreno Vallery
- Hon. Ana Beltran, Westmoreland
- Hon. Daniel Brotman, Glendale
- Hon. Margaret Clark, Rosemead
- Hon. Robert Copeland, Signal Hill
- Hon. Ned Davis, Westlake Village
- Hon. Julian Gold, Beverly Hills
- Hon. Shari Horne, Laguna Woods
- Hon. Britt Huff, Rolling Hills Estates
- Hon. Elaine Litster, Simi Valley
- Hon. Diana Mahmud, South Pasadena
- Hon. Cynthia Moran, Chino Hills
- Hon. Oscar Ortiz, Indio
- Sup. Luis Plancarte
- Hon. Greg Raths, Mission Viejo
- Hon. Deborah Robertson, Rialto
- Hon. Richard Rollins, Port Hueneme
- Hon. Rhonda Shader, Placentia
- Hon. Jesus Silva, Fullerton
- Hon. Sharon Springer, Burbank
- Hon. John Valdivia, San Bernardino

District 46

- WRCOG
- ICTC
- AVCJPA
- SGVCOG
- GCCOG
- LVMCOG
- WSCCOG
- OCCOG
- SBCCOG
- VCOG
- SGVCOG
- SBCTA
- CVAG
- Imperial County
- OCCOG
- District 8
- VCOG
- President’s Appointment
- President’s Appointment
- SFVCOG
- SBCCOG

OUR MISSION

To foster innovative regional solutions that improve the lives of Southern Californians through inclusive collaboration, visionary planning, regional advocacy, information sharing, and promoting best practices.

OUR VISION

Southern California’s Catalyst for a Brighter Future

OUR CORE VALUES

Be Open | Lead by Example | Make an Impact | Be Courageous

Members Not Present

Hon. Maria Davila, South Gate	GCCOG
Hon. Jordan Ehrenkranz, Canyon Lake	WRCOG
Hon. Edward H.J. Wilson, Signal Hill	GCCOG

CALL TO ORDER AND PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair David Pollock called the meeting to order at 9:31 a.m. Staff confirmed that a quorum was present. Councilmember Margaret Clark, Rosemead, SGVCOG, led the Pledge of Allegiance.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Chair David Pollock and SCAG staff provided instructions for public comment. Chair Pollock opened the Public Comment Period.

SCAG staff announced that one public comment was received prior to the deadline for written public comments on Wednesday, January 6 at 5pm, and that comment has been transmitted to members. No public comments were received after the deadline.

Seeing there were no public comment speakers, Chair Pollock closed the Public Comment Period.

REVIEW AND PRIORITIZE AGENDA ITEMS

There were no requests to prioritize agenda items.

CONSENT CALENDAR**Approval Items**

1. Minutes of the Meeting - November 5, 2020

Receive and File

2. California Air Resources Board (CARB) Acceptance of Connect SoCal and Recommendations

A MOTION was made (Robertson) to approve the Consent Calendar. Motion was SECONDED (Plancarte) and passed by the following votes:

AYE/S: Baca, Beltran, Brotman, Clark, Copeland, Horne, Huff, Litster, Moran, Plancarte, Pollock, Rath, Robertson, Shader and Springer (15)

NOE/S: None (0)

ABSTAIN/S: Gold and Valdivia (2)

ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

3. Election of Energy and Environment Committee Vice Chair

Chair Pollock announced the EEC Vice Chair vacancy due to former EEC Vice Chair Carmen Ramirez's election as Ventura County Supervisor. Chair Pollock stated that, prior to the meeting, staff had received one nomination from Regional Councilmember Deborah Robertson, Rialto, District 8. Chair Pollock opened nominations from the floor. Hearing no nominations from the floor, Chair Pollock closed nominations, and he announced Deborah Robertson as winner by acclamation.

Regional Councilmember Robertson provided brief remarks.

Deborah Robertson was elected as 2020-21 EEC Vice Chair for the remainder of the 2020-21 term by the following roll call votes:

AYE/S: Baca, Beltran, Brotman, Clark, Copeland, Davis, Gold, Horne, Huff, Litster, Mahmud, Moran, Plancarte, Pollock, Rath, Robertson, Shader, Springer and Valdivia (19)

NOE/S: None (0)

ABSTAIN/S: None (0)

4. Climate Change Action Resolution

Sarah Jepson, Planning Director, provided background information on the Climate Change Action Resolution, affirming a climate change crisis in Southern California, and calling on local and regional partners to join together to further reduce greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions, improve regional resilience, and reduce hazards from a changing climate. She recapitulated requests of the EEC and direction based on discussion at the last meeting in November.

Ms. Jepson introduced Kimberly Clark, Program Manager, to provide a presentation on the item. Ms. Clark mentioned that the presentation is based on direction at the October meeting and incorporates input from the November meeting. She began the presentation with a review of temperature changes in California and years with extreme drought. She discussed the FEMA National Risk Index, which has identified Southern California as one of the most vulnerable areas in

the U.S. due to natural hazards, many of which are being exacerbated by climate change. She outlined impacts of climate change, spanning from extreme heat to pests and ecological hazards, on both individuals and communities. She spoke about the cost of these impacts and the disproportionate impacts on vulnerable communities, economically and health-wise.

Ms. Clark shared specifics of feedback gathered from the November meeting of the EEC and revisions which have since been made by staff, including additional economic analysis showing the costs of climate change and integrated planning for zero emission vehicle deployment. She then outlined components of the resolution in detail, and she discussed its link to Connect SoCal and associated plan goals. She closed her presentation by stating staff's recommendation.

Councilmember Margaret Clark, Rosemead, SGVCOG, asked about the accelerated electrification strategy and questioned if the resolution clarifies the balance of renewable energy. Ms. Kimberly Clark clarified that the resolution, within its text, emphasizes support for zero-emission vehicle deployment, and she stated that renewable gas has a place in hydrogen production, which is a zero-emission opportunity.

Regional Councilmember Deborah Robertson, Rialto, District 8, commented on technology that is incorporating methane gas and organic waste processing into the gas grid. She asked if loss of life was incorporated into the resolution. Ms. Clark pointed towards the economic costs of climate change, which does consider loss of life, and she further discussed preventable deaths caused by respiratory hazards from wildfires.

Councilmember John Valdivia, San Bernardino, SBCCOG, commented on homebuilding and added costs based on environmentally-based restrictions. He suggested developing an economic factor for businesses, home developers and home buyers to understand relevant cost impacts.

Councilmember Rhonda Shader, Placentia, President's Appointment, commented on the nature of the resolution, as well as the pros and cons of the associated costs of climate action and adaptations.

Councilmember Sharon Springer, Burbank, SFVCOG, commented on the inclusion and importance of supporting affordable storage for renewable energy.

A MOTION was made (Shader) to recommend that the Regional Council adopt Resolution No. 21-628-1 on Climate Change Action. Motion was SECONDED (Valdivia) and passed by the following votes:

AYE/S: Baca, Beltran, Brotman, Clark, Copeland, Davis, Gold, Horne, Litster, Mahmud, Moran, Ortiz, Plancarte, Pollock, Rath, Robertson, Rollins, Shader,

Silva, Springer and Valdivia (21)

NOE/S: None (0)

ABSTAIN/S: None (0)

INFORMATION ITEMS

5. Changing Energy Marketplace

Ted Bardacke, Clean Power Alliance, provided a presentation on energy industry trends. He began his presentation by sharing background on the Clean Power Alliance (CPA) and remarks on the community choice aggregation movement. He summarized developments in the energy sector seen in 2020, including those involving climate change, energy reliability, and affordability. He spoke about related responses from regulators, elected officials, and energy providers.

Mr. Bardacke continued his presentation with further detail on CPA, stating that CPA is the nation's top provider of 100% renewable energy and is responsible for reducing over one million tons of GHG annually. He spoke about job growth created through renewable energy projects and local benefits associated with local control and investment into local programs. He noted that CPA serves one million customer accounts across 32-member agency jurisdictions, and he explained a bill credit program for customers experiencing hardship from COVID-19. He stated that CPA is focused on power supply, and he subsequently outlined steps for electricity generation, reviewing generation, transmission, distribution, and finally the end use customer. However, Mr. Bardacke noted that the end use customer is increasingly part of the management of the electricity system.

Mr. Bardacke then emphasized the impacts on climate change, highlighting effects from wildfires in 2020, which reduced solar production and caused public power shutoffs. He stressed that, despite GHG mitigation efforts, impacts will continue to increase, so adaptation coupled with continued decarbonization is necessary. He expressed that public support for mitigation is strong and growing nationally. He provided information on reliability issues, pinpointing weather-related outages, slowly-adapting regulations, and high political risk. He discussed capacity shortfalls, demonstrating the rotating outages in August 2020 occurred not after the system peak demand, but rather at the "net peak." He clarified that all resources, except for solar, delivered less energy in real time than contracted, countering opinions that fossil fuel plants ensure reliability. He then discussed affordability, noting the cost of infrastructure upgrades that are needed to adapt to current climate impacts and supply/store decarbonization efforts. Furthermore, he spoke about a COVID-19 overhang, considering that numerous customers have been unable to pay bills during a moratorium on disconnections. However, he commented that customers have been shown to pay more for

environmental progress.

He continued his presentation by discussing the regulatory response to aforementioned issues and trends. He speculated on a focus on reliability overhauls in summer 2021 to avoid repeating problems seen in summer 2020 as well as future considerations on disconnections related to COVID-19 nonpayment. Subsequently, he postulated a legislative response, involving new engagement at a federal level, a focus on reliability, and movement on goals related to transportation and building electrification. He mentioned a risk of drought and a possible shift of thinking if drought mitigation, rather than carbon reduction, was to dominate political attention.

He concluded by delineating CPA's priorities and opportunities. He spoke about reliable decarbonization, involving resource diversification and investment in batteries, program expansion particularly focused on critical facilities and disadvantaged communities, and transportation and building electrification.

Councilmember Oscar Ortiz, Indio, CVAG, commented on SunLine Transit and the use of hydrogen fuel in supplementing power to buses. He asked how the use of hydrogen fuel will affect batteries for other uses. Mr. Bardacke responded by noting observed price decreases for batteries of 60 percent over the past five years and stating that it is a competitive market. However, Mr. Bardacke questioned how hydrogen would be produced and noted the importance of production with renewable energy. Councilmember Ortiz asked about resources for manufacturing batteries. Mr. Bardacke acknowledged this issue and the supply of lithium resources in the state.

Councilmember Elaine Litster, Simi Valley, VCOG, asked about the difference in price provided by CPA versus other providers. Mr. Bardacke outlined three rates offered by CPA. He explained that these rates are selected by customers, although communities choose the default level. Councilmember Litster asked what it would take for CPA to achieve cost parity with Southern California Edison (SCE)'s rate. Mr. Bardacke explained that cost changes will occur over time as existing gas plants phase out and further investment in renewables occur. Councilmember Diana Mahmud, South Pasadena, SGVCOG, compared CPA's rate to SCE's rate and subsidies available. Councilmember Litster asked Mr. Bardacke if Public Safety Power Shutoffs (PSPS) can be attributed to weather-related outages. Mr. Bardacke clarified that CPA is not involved in the decision-making for PSPS, and these decisions are made by SCE based on authority granted. He remarked that investments needed to reduce PSPS will impact all customers' rates.

Councilmember Sharon Springer, Burbank, SFVCOG, asked if the 100 percent renewable level is achieved through renewable energy storage or credits. Mr. Bardacke responded that all of CPA's renewable energy is actual energy, rather than Unbundled Renewable Energy Certificates (RECs). She asked how CPA's renewable energy is distributed and stored; Mr. Bardacke clarified that some is put back into the grid.

Councilmember Daniel Brotman, Glendale, AVCJPA, asked how to formalize positive outcomes of demand response witnessed to date and methods to encourage large customers to respond accordingly. Mr. Bardacke spoke about the opportunity of large customers to improve demand response. He suggested the benefit of installing of batteries on site, giving large customers the ability to draw from in critical times. He noted the success of demand response, particularly for residential customers with smart thermostats.

Regional Councilmember Deborah Robertson, Rialto, District 8, commented on Councilmember Mahmud's role as Chair of the CPA Board of Directors. Regional Councilmember Robertson mentioned a goal of taking advantage of land and development by incorporating batteries on site, and she thanked Mr. Bardacke for his presentation.

Councilmember Rhonda Shader, Placentia, President's Appointment, expressed concern about tradeoffs of relevant decisions, calling out the associated environmental costs of lithium batteries. Mr. Bardacke spoke about CPA's robust commissioning plans of new projects and decommissioning plans for old projects. Regarding lithium recycling, he noted that battery packs from end-of-life electric vehicles can be arranged for industrial-scale storage.

Councilmember Diana Mahmud, South Pasadena, SGVCOG, indicated that South Pasadena recently completed its Climate Action Plan, and she stated that the city has made progress in reducing GHGs by becoming a 100 percent renewable energy jurisdiction. She spoke about continuing declines in the price for renewable energy.

Chair Pollock thanked Mr. Bardacke for his presentation.

6. Overview of 2022 South Coast Air Quality Management Plan and Near-term Air Quality Planning Challenges

Sarah Jepson, Planning Director, introduced Dr. Philip Fine, South Coast Air Quality Management District (AQMD). Dr. Fine previously presented to SCAG in 2016 and to the Transportation Committee last November on the latest iterations of the South Coast Air Quality Management Plan (AQMP). Ms. Jepson noted that South Coast Air Quality Management Plan is a joint effort between South Coast AQMD, California Air Resources Board, and SCAG.

Dr. Fine began his presentation with recent air quality planning efforts, reviewing PM2.5 national ambient air quality standards and 8-hour ozone standard. He first reviewed the South Coast Air Basin's attainment status of PM2.5 standard, stating that the 2006 standard was missed by the attainment deadline of 2019, triggering an implementation update which was sent by South Coast AQMD to EPA at the end of 2020. Dr. Fine demonstrated progress towards attainment, stating that

it is likely that the standard will be met by the end of 2020. He mentioned that exceptional events, like the 2020 wildfires, can be excluded in certain circumstances. He then reviewed Coachella Valley's attainment status of ozone national ambient air quality standards, stating that the 1997 standard was not met, and a new deadline of 2024 (2023 from a planning perspective) has been submitted. He noted that ozone exceedances in Coachella Valley are primarily due to the direct inland transport of ozone and its precursors from the South Coast Air Basin. He elaborated on a pathway to attainment.

Dr. Fine continued his presentation by reviewing the 2022 AQMP. South Coast AQMD plans for 2015 8-hour ozone emissions reductions the year before the deadline of 2038 for South Coast and 2033 for the Coachella Valley. He outlined implementation plan elements and timeline for meeting standards. He then explained the overall control strategy for attaining 2015 8-hour ozone, emphasizing the need to transition to near-zero and zero-emissions technologies, regulatory measures, funding sources for incentive programs and reductions from buildings. He outlined three working groups by South Coast AQMD for control measure development, and he displayed the 2022 AQMP overall scheduled.

Finally, Dr. Fine discussed the short-term 2023 ozone attainment challenge. He demonstrated progress in nitrogen oxide (NOx) reductions since 1997, although 11 percent of the reduction remains. He explained the contribution of federal sources in NOx emissions, comprising about 36 percent of NOx emissions, and potential federal measures towards reduction. He shared an overview of additional incentive funding and various sources to improve air quality. In summary, he stated that the attainment of the 1997 8-hour ozone standard continues to represent a major challenge for the region and warned of possible sanctions without federal action. Additionally, he noted the challenge of extreme heat waves and wildfires in 2020, while noting that emissions continue to decline.

Councilmember Oscar Ortiz, Indio, CVAG, asked if the described NOx reduction in tons/day applies to the South Coast area or the entire state. Dr. Fine clarified that it is just for the South Coast Basin.

Councilmember Margaret Clark, Rosemead, SGVCOG, asked about potential repercussions for the South Coast Basin based on the pollution within the South Coast Basin travelling to the Coachella Valley. Dr. Fine stated that Coachella Valley's requirement exists regardless, and he described comparable situations on the East Coast. He noted that South Coast AQMD is responsible for both areas. Councilmember Clark asked about pollution travelling from China. Dr. Fine noted that the impact of Pan Pacific pollution tends to be found in the Pacific Northwest and in higher elevations, rather than directly affecting Southern California.

Councilmember Oscar Ortiz, Indio, CVAG, commented on wind carrying pollution in the Coachella Valley. Dr. Fine spoke about the differences between ozone challenges and air quality challenges,

while acknowledging dust issues and issues around the Salton Sea specific to the Coachella Valley.

7. Update on AB 617 Community Plans in the South Coast AQMD

Dr. Jo Kay Ghosh, South Coast AQMD, provided a presentation on the implementation of Assembly Bill (AB) 617 community plans. Dr. Ghosh began her presentation with a background on AB 617, which was signed into law in July 2017 and requires a statewide strategy to reduce toxic air contaminants and criteria pollutants in disadvantaged communities. Communities, reviewed annually, can be designated for a Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP) and/or a Community Air Monitoring Plan (CAMP). Within South Coast AQMD, there are five designated communities and one pending, to be determined by the California Air Resources Board. She provided a timeline for CERP and CAMP, from launch, followed by development, and concluding with a five-year implementation phase. She described air quality priorities in the adopted CERPs for designated communities within South Coast AQMD, including Southeast Los Angeles and Eastern Coachella Valley.

Dr. Ghosh continued by reviewing the status of implementation for the communities designated in 2018. She described ongoing community meetings and outreach as well as a summary of CERP actions. For Wilmington, Carson, West Long Beach, she shared examples of CERP actions, such as mobile fence-line monitoring at refineries and truck idling sweeps. For San Bernardino, Muscoy, an area concerned about emissions from trucks and other diesel sources, she shared an example of assisting OmniTrans in transitioning to zero emissions buses. For East Los Angeles, Boyle Heights, West Commerce, an area concerned with emissions from trucks and rail and industrial facilities, she described outreach regarding impacts of a rendering facility. She discussed tracking emissions reductions in each community based on total investment. In conclusion, she outlined continuing and upcoming work for all communities.

Chair Pollock designated Vice Chair-Elect, Regional Councilmember Deborah Robertson, Rialto, District 8, as Presiding Officer for the remainder of meeting. Regional Councilmember Robertson thanked Dr. Ghosh for the presentation.

Councilmember Britt Huff, Rolling Hills Estates, SBCCOG, expressed concern about large buses with few passengers causing emissions and asked for more details about relevant issues. Dr. Ghosh clarified that the specific concern in San Bernardino is particular to a bus yard adjacent to homes and schools within the community. She spoke about the California Air Resources Board (CARB) rule regarding zero-emissions buses. Dr. Philip Fine mentioned budgetary difficulties faced by transit agencies due to decreased revenue. Councilmember Huff asked if bus emissions were a significant factor in pollution. Dr. Fine specified that heavy-duty trucks, given the greater quantity, are a much more significant issue.



Regional Councilmember Deborah Robertson, Rialto, District 8, asked about schools' involvement in the San Bernardino, Muscoy CERP. She mentioned issues of idling railyards, and she expressed desire to explore Bloomington as a possible designated community in the future.

CHAIR'S REPORT

There was no Chair's Report provided.

STAFF REPORT

There was no Staff Report provided.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

There were no future agenda items requested.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

There were no announcements.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Regional Councilmember Deborah Robertson adjourned the Energy and Environment Committee meeting at 11:43 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Peter Waggoner
Energy and Environment Committee Clerk

[MINUTES ARE UNOFFICIAL UNTIL APPROVED BY THE EEC]
//

ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE ATTENDANCE REPORT

2020-21

MEMBERS	Representing	Jun (GA)	Jul	Aug	Sep	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar	April	May	Total Mtgs Attended To Date
Baca, Victoria	Moreno Valley, WRCOG								1					1
Beltran, Ana	Westmoreland, ICTC		0		0	0	0		1					1
Brotman, Daniel	Glendale, AVCJPA		1		1	1	1		1					5
Clark, Margaret	Rosemead, SGVCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Copeland, Robert	Signal Hill, GCCOG		1		0	1	1		1					4
Davila, Maria	South Gate, GCCOG		0		0	0	0		0					0
Davis, Ned	Westlake Village, LVMCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Ehrenkranz, Jordan	Canyon Lake, WRCOG		0		0	0	1		0					1
Gold, Julian	Beverly Hills, WSCCOG								1					1
Horne, Shari	Laguna Woods, OCCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Huff, Britt	Rolling Hills Estates, SCBCOG						1		1					2
Litster, Elaine	Simi Valley, VCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Mahmud, Diana	So. Pasadena, SGVCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Moran, Cynthia	Chino Hills, SBCTA	D	1	D	1	0	1	D	1					4
Ortiz, Oscar	Indio, CVAG	A	1	A	1	1	1	A	1					5
Plancarte, Luis	Imperial County		1		1	1	1		1					5
Pollock, David (CHAIR)	Moorpark, VCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Raths, Greg	Mission Viejo, OCCOG		1		1	1	0		1					4
Robertson, Deborah	Rialto, RC District 8		1		1	1	0		1					4
Rollins, Richard	Port Hueneme, VCOG		1		0	1	1		1					4
Shader, Rhonda	Placentia, President's Appointment		1		0	1	1		1					4
Silva, Jesus	Fullerton, President's Appointment				0	1	1		1					3
Springer, Sharon	Burbank, SFVCOG		1		1	1	1		1					5
Valdivia, John	San Bernardino, SBCCOG		1		0	1	1		1					4
Wilson, Edward H.J.	Signal Hill, GCCOG		1		0	1	1		0					3

Attachment: EEC Attendance Sheet 2020-21 (Minutes of the Meeting - January 7, 2021)